

Practice Evaluating Seminar Statements

Comment by Person A: “I believe that Jean Reynolds is not responsible for her life in poverty because it’s not her fault.”

Response #1: *I agree with Person A because I also think it’s not Jeans fault that she’s in poverty all these things are happening that she cannot control.*

(1) Good or bad? _____ (2) Why? _____

Response #2: *I agree with Person A and I would like to add that the fact that her daughter doesn’t have health insurance is a big deal. Also, Jean did not get a raise in her job.*

(1) Good or bad? _____ (2) Why? _____

Response #3: *I want to push Person A on their statement because there are a lot of facts to back up his argument. I don’t think Jean is responsible for her life in poverty for various reasons. For one, her daughter Bridget has a very serious disease – thyroid cancer, and because she cannot work, she doesn’t have health insurance. Jean becomes responsible for her costly medical payments (\$800 per month) when Bridget cannot pay for them. Also, Jean has fought hard for a raise in her job, but because her nursing home was not offered a new contract, she doesn’t get a 3% raise in her paycheck. Thus, she is stuck supporting 7 children and grandchildren on a salary of \$11 an hour.*

(1) Good or bad? _____ (2) Why? _____

Now, use one of the connectors to respond to the following statement:

I believe that Jean could help her situation by selling some of her possessions.

Your Response: _____

Connectors to Help You in Seminar Discussion

Agree

- * I agree with _____ because...
- * I would like to add to _____'s point and say that...
- * There is evidence for what _____ is saying in the film when....

Questioning

- * Why do you think that _____ did/said/ ____?
- * To what extent is it the case that _____?
- * Would you all agree with the statement _____? Why or why not?

Disagree

- * _____ I interpreted things differently. What I think is...
- * _____ made a good point, but I see it a little differently. The way I see it is...
- * That's an interesting point _____, but I have a different opinion. My opinion is...

Clarifying

- * I think I understand what you are getting at, but I am not sure. Can you explain it a little bit more?
- * What part of the film made you think that?

